

Statistical equilibrium for trace elements in stellar atmospheres

Jiří Kubát

kubat@sunstel.asu.cas.cz

Astronomický ústav AV ČR Ondřejov

Outline

1. Stellar atmosphere problem
2. Comparison of LTE and NLTE
 - (a) Thermodynamic equilibrium
 - (b) Local thermodynamic equilibrium (LTE)
 - (c) Statistical equilibrium (NLTE)
 - (d) Microscopic processes
3. Trace elements
4. Equations of statistical equilibrium
 - (a) Radiative rates
 - (b) Collisional rates
5. Conclusions

Stellar atmosphere problem

solution of the stellar atmosphere problem – searching for distributions:

- momentum distribution (velocities of all particles)
- distribution of particle internal degrees of freedom (populations of atomic excitation stages)
- distribution of internal degrees of freedom of the electromagnetic field (radiation field for all frequencies, directions, polarization)

Thermodynamic equilibrium

conditions for equilibrium

- $t_{\text{relaxation}} \ll t_{\text{macroscopic changes}}$
- $l_{\text{macroscopic changes}} \ll \bar{l}_{\text{free path}}$
- $t_{\text{relaxation}} \ll t_{\text{inelastic collisions}}$
- **for $t_{\text{relaxation}} \gtrsim t_{\text{inelastic collisions}}$ colliding particles have to be in equilibrium**

Hubený 1976, PhD thesis

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- electron (and other particle) velocities
– *Maxwellian distribution*

$$f(v) dv = \frac{1}{v_0 \sqrt{\pi}} e^{-\frac{v^2}{v_0^2}} dv$$

most probable speed: $v_0 = \sqrt{\frac{2kT}{m_e}}$

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- atomic level populations
 - *Boltzmann distribution*

$$\frac{n_i^*}{n_0^*} = \frac{g_i}{g_0} e^{-\frac{\chi_i}{kT}}$$

- ionization degrees distribution
 - *Saha equation*

$$\frac{N_j^*}{N_{j+1}^*} = n_e \frac{U_j(T)}{2U_{j+1}(T)} \left(\frac{h^2}{2\pi m_e kT} \right)^{\frac{3}{2}} e^{\frac{\chi_{Ij}}{kT}}$$

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- radiation field – *Planck distribution*

$$B_\nu(T) = \frac{2h\nu}{c^2} \frac{1}{e^{\frac{h\nu}{kT}} - 1}$$

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
- level populations – Saha-Boltzmann distribution
- radiation field – Planck distribution

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
- level populations – Saha-Boltzmann distribution
- radiation field – Planck distribution

contradicts observations

Thermodynamic equilibrium

distributions in equilibrium

- electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
- level populations – Saha-Boltzmann distribution
- radiation field – ~~Planck distribution~~

contradicts observations

Local thermodynamic equilibrium

- locally equilibrium distributions
(we ignore the dependence $T(\vec{r})$, $N(\vec{r})$)
 - electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
 - level populations – Saha-Boltzmann distribution
- non-equilibrium distribution
 - radiation field – calculated by RTE solution

$$\mu \frac{dI_{\mu\nu}}{dz} = \eta_{\nu} - \chi_{\nu} I_{\mu\nu}$$

with the source function equal to the Planck function

$$S_{\nu} = \frac{\eta_{\nu}}{\chi_{\nu}} = B_{\nu}$$

Local thermodynamic equilibrium

- locally equilibrium distributions
(we ignore the dependence $T(\vec{r})$, $N(\vec{r})$)
 - electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
 - level populations – Saha-Boltzmann distribution
- non-equilibrium distribution
 - radiation field – calculated by RTE solution

$$\mu \frac{dI_{\mu\nu}}{dz} = \eta_{\nu} - \chi_{\nu} I_{\mu\nu}$$

with the source function equal to the Planck function

$$S_{\nu} = \frac{\eta_{\nu}}{\chi_{\nu}} = B_{\nu}$$

Local thermodynamic equilibrium

- locally equilibrium distributions
(we ignore the dependence $T(\vec{r})$, $N(\vec{r})$)
 - electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution
 - level populations – ~~Saha-Boltzmann distribution~~
- non-equilibrium distribution
 - radiation field – calculated by RTE solution

$$\mu \frac{dI_{\mu\nu}}{dz} = \eta_{\nu} - \chi_{\nu} I_{\mu\nu}$$

with the source function equal to the Planck function

$$S_{\nu} = \frac{\eta_{\nu}}{\chi_{\nu}} = B_{\nu}$$

Statistical equilibrium

usually called NLTE or non-LTE

- equilibrium distribution

electron velocities – Maxwellian distribution

- non-equilibrium distributions

level populations – statistical equilibrium

radiation field – calculated by RTE solution

Microscopic processes

particle collisions

- elastic collisions ($e-e$, $e-H$, $e-H^+$, $e-He$, $H-H$, $H-He$, ...) maintain equilibrium velocity distribution
- inelastic collisions with electrons
 - excitation: $e(v) + X \rightarrow e(v' < v) + X^*$
 - deexcitation: $e(v) + X^* \rightarrow e(v' > v) + X$
 - ionization: $e + X \rightarrow 2e + X^+$
 - recombination: $2e + X^+ \rightarrow e + X$
- inelastic collisions with other particles less frequent \Rightarrow neglected

Microscopic processes

interaction with radiation

- excitation: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^*$
- deexcitation:
 - spontaneous: $X^* \rightarrow \nu + X$
 - stimulated: $\nu + X^* \rightarrow 2\nu + X$
- ionization: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^+ + e$
- recombination:
 - spontaneous: $e + X^+ \rightarrow \nu + X$
 - stimulated: $\nu + e + X^+ \rightarrow 2\nu + X$

Microscopic processes

interaction with radiation

- excitation: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^*$
- deexcitation:
 - spontaneous: $X^* \rightarrow \nu + X$
 - stimulated: $\nu + X^* \rightarrow 2\nu + X$
- ionization: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^+ + e$
 - autoionization: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^{**} \rightarrow X^+ + e$
 - Auger ionization: $\nu + X \rightarrow X^{+*}$
- recombination:
 - spontaneous: $e + X^+ \rightarrow \nu + X$
 - stimulated: $\nu + e + X^+ \rightarrow 2\nu + X$
 - dielectronic recombination: $X^+ + e \rightarrow X^{**} \rightarrow \nu + X$

Microscopic processes

- free-free transitions $\nu + e + X \leftrightarrow e + X$
- electron scattering
 - free (Compton, Thomson): $\nu + e \rightarrow \nu + e$
 - bound (Rayleigh): $\nu + X \rightarrow \nu + X$

LTE and NLTE

- **silent background** – maxwellian velocity distribution
 - inelastic collisions (collisional ionizations and excitations) destroy equilibrium velocity distribution
 - equilibrium is maintained by elastic collisions
 - $t_{\text{relaxation}} \ll t_{\text{inelastic collisions}}$ for most situations
 - exceptions: medium with few electrons

in the following we assume maxwellian (i.e. equilibrium) velocity distribution for all particles
radiation field is not in equilibrium – determined via the solution of the radiative transfer equation

LTE versus NLTE

maxwellian velocity distribution

- processes entering the game
 - collisional excitation and ionization (E)
 - radiative recombination (E)
 - free-free transitions (E)
 - photoionization
 - radiative excitation and deexcitation
 - elastic collisions (E)
 - Auger ionization
 - autoionization
 - dielectronic recombination (E)

LTE versus NLTE

detailed balance

- rate of each process is balanced by rate of the reverse process
- maxwellian distribution of electrons \Rightarrow collisional processes in detailed balance
- radiative transitions in detailed balance only for Planck radiation field
- if $J_\nu \neq B_\nu \Rightarrow$ LTE not acceptable approximation

Trace elements

we have a model atmosphere (LTE or NLTE)

- assume that our model atmosphere is correct
- trace elements
 1. negligible effect on the atmospheric structure
 2. effect only on emergent radiation, but [1] must be valid
- given $T(r)$, $n_e(r)$, $n_i^{\text{back}}(r) \Rightarrow$ background opacities
- solve RTE+ESE for trace elements

Trace elements – some warnings

- always check, if the trace element is really a trace element
- electrons from more abundant “trace” elements (C,N,O,...) may change the total number of free electrons
- background opacities should be the same as in the model atmosphere calculation
- LTE model atmosphere inconsistent with NLTE for trace elements
 - LTE \Rightarrow enough collisions with e^- for H, He; why not for a trace element?
 - equilibrium can be maintained only via detailed balance
 - once detailed balance is violated, equilibrium is away
 - there may be regions, where equilibrium is met
- NLTE model atmosphere highly preferable

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (n_i \vec{v}) = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (n_i \vec{v}) = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j
continuity equation for element k ,

$$\frac{\partial N_k}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (N_k \vec{v}) = 0.$$

gas continuity equation

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho \vec{v}) = 0.$$

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$\cancel{\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial t}} + \nabla \cdot (n_i \vec{v}) = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

- stationary state or negligible changes with time – without $\partial/\partial t$

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$\cancel{\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial t}} + \cancel{\nabla \cdot (n_i \vec{v})} = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

- stationary state or negligible changes with time – without $\partial/\partial t$
- static state ($\vec{v} = 0$) or negligible advection (used in stellar winds) – also without ∇

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$0 = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

- stationary state or negligible changes with time – without $\partial/\partial t$
- static state ($\vec{v} = 0$) or negligible advection (used in stellar winds) – also without ∇

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$0 = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

- $P_{ij} = R_{ij} + C_{ij}$
- R_{ij} – radiative rates
- C_{ij} – collisional rates

Equations of statistical equilibrium

change of the state i of each element

$$0 = \sum_{j \neq i} (n_j P_{ji} - n_i P_{ij})$$

P_{ij} – transition probability from the level i to the level j

- detailed balance is for $n_j P_{ji} = n_i P_{ij}$, for $\forall i, j$
- equilibrium populations n_i^* ,

Equilibrium level populations

- n_i^* – LTE level population
- departure coefficients $b_i = \frac{n_i}{n_i^*}$, for LTE $b_i = 1$

definition of $n_{i,j}^*$ (level i of ion j)

1. population with the assumption of LTE

2.
$$n_{i,j}^* = n_{0,j+1} n_e \frac{g_{ij}}{g_{0,j+1}} \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{h^2}{2\pi m k T} \right)^{\frac{3}{2}} e^{-\frac{\chi_{Ij} - \chi_{ij}}{kT}}$$

$n_{0,j+1}$ – actual population of the ground level of the next higher ion

Radiative rates – bound-free

photoionization from the state i :

amount of absorbed energy: $4\pi J_\nu \alpha_{ik}(\nu) d\nu$

number of photoionization is obtained dividing by $h\nu$ and integrating from 0 to ∞ :

$$n_i R_{ik} = n_i 4\pi \int_{\nu_0}^{\infty} \frac{\alpha_{ik}}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process
for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* R_{ik}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} B_\nu d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process

for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* R_{ik}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} B_\nu d\nu$$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[B_\nu \left(1 - e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right) + B_\nu e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right] d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process

for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* R_{ik}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} B_\nu d\nu$$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[B_\nu \left(1 - e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right) + B_\nu e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right] d\nu$$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process

for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* R_{ik}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} B_\nu d\nu$$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[B_\nu \left(1 - e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right) + B_\nu e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} \right] d\nu$$

$$n_k^* R_{ki}^* = n_i^* 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

per ion

$$R_{ki}^* = \frac{n_i^*}{n_k^*} 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process
for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$
per ion

$$R_{ki}^* = \frac{n_i^*}{n_k^*} 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process
for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$
per ion

$$R_{ki} = R_{ki}^* = \frac{n_i^*}{n_k^*} 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

valid also outside TE

Radiative rates – free-bound

photorecombination – collisional process
for TE \Rightarrow detailed balance and $J_\nu = B_\nu$
per ion

$$R_{ki} = R_{ki}^* = \frac{n_i^*}{n_k^*} 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + B_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

valid also outside TE

replace $B_\nu \rightarrow J_\nu$ and multiply by actual number of ions n_k

$$n_k R_{ki} = n_k \frac{n_i^*}{n_k^*} 4\pi \int_0^\infty \frac{\alpha_{ik}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + J_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (up)

number of transitions $i \rightarrow j$ caused by intensity I in $d\nu d\omega$

$$n_i B_{ij} \phi_\nu I_\nu d\nu \frac{d\omega}{4\pi} = n_i B_{ij} \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu$$

total number of absorptions by integration over the profile

$$n_i R_{ij} = n_i B_{ij} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu = n_i 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{ij}(\nu)}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

since $\alpha_\nu = \frac{h\nu}{4\pi} B_{ij} \phi_\nu$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

number of stimulated emissions

$$n_j R_{ji}^{\text{stim}} = n_j B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu = n_i 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{ij}(\nu)}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

number of stimulated emissions

$$n_j R_{ji}^{\text{stim}} = n_j B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu = n_i 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{ij}(\nu)}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

number of spontaneous emissions

$$n_j R_{ji}^{\text{spont}} = n_j A_{ji} = n_j \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} B_{ji} = n_j \frac{g_i}{g_j} \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} B_{ij} = n_j \frac{g_i}{g_j} \frac{4\pi}{h\nu_{ij}} \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} \alpha_{ij}$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

number of stimulated emissions

$$n_j R_{ji}^{\text{stim}} = n_j B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu = n_i 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{ij}(\nu)}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

number of spontaneous emissions

$$n_j R_{ji}^{\text{spont}} = n_j A_{ji} = n_j \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} B_{ji} = n_j \frac{g_i}{g_j} \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} B_{ij} = n_j \frac{g_i}{g_j} \frac{4\pi}{h\nu_{ij}} \frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} \alpha_{ij}$$

total number of emissions

$$n_j R_{ji} = n_j \left(A_{ji} + B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right)$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

total number of emissions

$$n_j R_{ji} = n_j \left(A_{ji} + B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right)$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

total number of emissions

$$\begin{aligned}n_j R_{ji} &= n_j \left(A_{ji} + B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right) \\ &= n_j \frac{4\pi}{h\nu_{ij}} \frac{g_i}{g_j} \alpha_{ij} \left[\frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} + \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right]\end{aligned}$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

total number of emissions

$$\begin{aligned}n_j R_{ji} &= n_j \left(A_{ji} + B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right) \\ &= n_j \frac{4\pi}{h\nu_{ij}} \frac{g_i}{g_j} \alpha_{ij} \left[\frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} + \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right]\end{aligned}$$

the Boltzmann equation

$$\frac{n_i^*}{n_j^*} = \frac{g_i}{g_j} \exp\left(\frac{h\nu_{ij}}{kT}\right)$$

Radiative rates – bound-bound (down)

total number of emissions

$$\begin{aligned}n_j R_{ji} &= n_j \left(A_{ji} + B_{ji} \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right) \\&= n_j \frac{4\pi}{h\nu_{ij}} \frac{g_i}{g_j} \alpha_{ij} \left[\frac{2h\nu_{ij}^3}{c^2} + \int \phi_\nu J_\nu d\nu \right] \\&= n_j \frac{n_i^*}{n_j^*} 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{ij}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + J_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu\end{aligned}$$

the Boltzmann equation

$$\frac{n_i^*}{n_j^*} = \frac{g_i}{g_j} \exp\left(\frac{h\nu_{ij}}{kT}\right)$$

Radiative rates – total

upward $i \rightarrow l$:

$$n_i R_{il} = n_i 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{il}(\nu)}{h\nu} J_\nu d\nu$$

downward $l \rightarrow i$:

$$n_l R_{li} = n_l \frac{n_i^*}{n_l^*} 4\pi \int \frac{\alpha_{il}(\nu)}{h\nu} \left[\frac{2h\nu^3}{c^2} + J_\nu \right] e^{-\frac{h\nu}{kT}} d\nu$$

Collisional rates

sufficient to consider only electrons, because $v_{\text{th,e}}/v_{\text{th,i}} \approx 43\sqrt{A}$
rate up

$$n_i C_{ij} = n_i n_e \int_{v_0}^{\infty} \sigma_{ij}(v) f(v) v \, dv = n_i n_e q_{ij}(T)$$

$\sigma_{ij}(v)$ – total cross section of the transition $i \rightarrow j$

rate down from the detailed balance $n_j^* C_{ji} = n_i^* C_{ij}$

$$n_j C_{ji} = n_j \left(\frac{n_i^*}{n_j^*} \right) C_{ij} = n_j \left(\frac{n_i^*}{n_j^*} \right) n_e q_{ij}(T)$$

System of statistical equilibrium equations

∀ level

$$n_i \sum_l (R_{il} + C_{il}) + \sum_l n_l (R_{li} + C_{li}) = 0 \quad (1)$$

linearly dependent equations
supplementary equations

- charge conservation $\sum_k \sum_j j N_{jk} + n_p = n_e$
- particle number conservation $\sum_k \sum_j N_{jk} = N_N$
- **abundance equation** $\sum_j N_{jk} = \frac{\alpha_k}{\alpha_H} \sum_j N_{jH}$

this system of equations is solved using methods described yesterday

Conclusions

- prefer NLTE model atmospheres
- decide, which element is a trace one and which one not
- verify your assumptions after calculations

Conclusions

- prefer NLTE model atmospheres
- decide, which element is a trace one and which one not
- verify your assumptions after calculations

never use any code as a black box